



**CTM Meeting
Monday, October 6, 2014
Clifton Cultural Arts Center**

Present: Ashley Fritz, Adam Balz, Buddy Goose, Tom Dwyer, Joyce Rich, Linda Ash, Kevin Marsh, Adam Hyland, Michael Moran, Tony Sizemore, Pat Knapp, Ben Pantoja, Bruce Bernard, Eric Urbas

Absent: Morgan Rich

Police Report

Neighborhood Officer Nick Hageman reported the biggest crime issue in Clifton currently is theft from auto. Police are passing out flyers in the neighborhood about preventing thefts. Hageman advised residents to lock their car doors, and don't leave valuables in the car. Property crimes are up 30% in Clifton. District 5 Commander Captain Bridget Bardua has approved extra shifts to help curb the problem. Police will put undercover cars out there hoping people will break into them. The cars are equipped with cameras to take pictures of people breaking into them.

He also cautioned residents not to leave windows open when they leave home. Burglars can easily get into second-floor windows as well.

Officer Nick Hageman can be reached at 513.569.8527; email is Nicholas.hageman@cincinnati-oh.gov

Fire Report

Capt. James Kettler of Engine 34 reported about 1,600 runs in September, including a kitchen fire at University Hospital. Saturday October 11 is an open house at the fire hall, 1-5 p.m. Firehouses will be open across the city.

Capt. Kettler reported that in Clifton Heights, a carbon monoxide leak occurred at a home when the family turned on the heater and didn't realize the flue pipe was clogged. Within 3 hours their house was filled with carbon monoxide. They were saved by someone who knocked at the door and saw them lying on the floor. Capt. Kettler cautioned that before starting gas heat for the winter, make sure the flue pipe is clear. Often at this time of year pipes get clogged with leaves. The fire hall has

some carbon monoxide detectors available for free, as well as smoke detectors. They have a limited supply, but can give references on where to get them. He also reminded people to change the smoke detector batteries in October and make sure you have smoke detectors and carbon monoxide detectors in your house. Carbon monoxide detectors need to be replaced every 4 to 5 years.

For more information, call 357.7501 or email, visit, or call Capt. Kettler at the fire station on Ludlow Avenue.

Recreation Center

CRC Service Manager Tom Reese reported that the construction at the center is ongoing. He's been told to start planning a grand opening in January. Most of the glass for the center has been delivered and installed. The front desk installation, including a greeting center, is being finished up this week. The parking lot has been paved and installation of accessible signage finished. Movie-in dates are TBD but the center plans to throw a party for retiring long-time center worker Arnelle Dow, who is retiring November 25.

Day and evening classes will re-open at the center in the winter. Classes/programs will include volleyball, pottery, fencing, community arts, etc. The center's yoga teacher, 87, will not be returning when the center re-opens so they are looking for a new yoga teacher.

CCAC

CCAC Board President Kevin Reevey reported there are two photo exhibits going on at the center currently: the biennial Foto Focus exhibition and Shedding Light by Jens Rosenkrantz, on display through November 5. Beautiful Deception is a group installation up through November. Sunday Family Showtime kicks off at 2 p.m. Sunday the first annual Cincinnati Archaeology Fair will be held 10 am until 3 pm,; it's free and open to the public. On Saturday, November 1, Highly Improbable, an improv group, will perform at 8 p.m. Tickets are \$7.50 in advance or \$9 at the door or call CCAC and put your order in. The center also has a full roster of classes in visual arts, dance, and wellness.

CTM Trustee Tom Dwyer reported that the CTM Golf Outing fundraiser in August benefits the CCAC and its efforts to renovate its Great Hall. He presented a check for \$7,500 to Reevey.

CBPA

Scott Crawford, president of Clifton Business & Professional Association, reported that CliftonFest was a big success. The plantings in the Ludlow Avenue flowerpots are getting changed this week. Clifton now has a BikeShare station on Howell Avenue by the Clifton Merchant Parking Lot. It is being used frequently. Holidays on Ludlow is coming up in December.

Crawford also reported a problem with panhandlers on Ludlow Avenue. He encouraged people to not give them money, because it motivates them to stay and to keep coming.

Minutes of September 2014 CTM meeting were approved.

Public Review of Ludlow 21 Report

The Ludlow 21 report, a study of the Ludlow Avenue business district by Urban Fast Forward/Kathleen Norris, will be presented to the public Thursday, October 16, 6-8 p.m., at CCAC. The study was sponsored by Uptown Consortium, Clifton Business & Professional Association, Clifton 20/20, and CTM.

Clifton Market Update

Clifton Market Treasurer Shaun McCance reported that the market has about 800 owners and has raised around \$600,00 in loans and gifts from owners, including a \$100,00 matching challenge from an anonymous donor. However, that is not sufficient yet to cover the purchase price for the building. The group's contract to purchase the building from Steve Goessling expires on October 7, but it has been extended for 90 days.

Changes in Public Services including Household Trash Cans and Trash Cans on Ludlow

Gerald Checco, Director of the City of Cincinnati's Public Services Department and a Clifton resident, reported on proposed new trash collection policies, which will likely be presented to City Council next month for a vote. A key focus is eliminating the unpopular one-trashcan-per-family rule.

With less resources and staff every year, the department is focusing on making the garbage collection routes as efficient as possible. Analysis and input from drivers and managers resulted in a plan to pick up trash 4 days a week rather than 5. On the 5th day, workers will do a "blitz," focusing on specific neighborhoods, doing intensive cleanups and roving the streets to pick up bulk items on the sidewalks. Clifton will be affected by the change in schedule because the east side of Clifton will be picked up on Tuesday and west Clifton on Thursday. Changes if approved will go into effect next year, and Checco will let CTM and the neighborhood know the exact streets affected.

The other big change is that residents will be allowed as many trashcans as they want that are liftable by city equipment. Residents will be able to purchase their own cans but will need to register them with the city. Trash collection has become a computerized operation. The Department of Public Services has lost 48% of staff in the last several years. Also, if the existing city-provided trashcans are too big or unwieldy for residents to manage, they can purchase their own or use plastic bags. Any dispensation will have to come with a request that will be evaluated based on the merits and potential hardship to residents.

During holiday weeks, trash will not be picked up on Saturdays. The department is drastically reducing overtime. Checco noted also that the department will work to reduce the amount of time it takes to pick up bulky items. Currently it takes 16.42 days from the time someone calls to actually pick up a bulk item on the street. The goal is less than 7 days. That is part of the reason for the “Friday blitz,” to put all hands on deck on Friday to do massive roaming to make sure everything that has been put on sidewalks during the week gets picked up. Keep Cincinnati Beautiful will be recruiting volunteers to help.

The department is also going to purchase 4 additional 40-yard dumpsters, which will be placed around neighborhoods to help curb illegal dumping. It will also drastically increase fines for dumping and illegal use of corner street cans. Illegal dumping of tires is a particular problem.

An outreach program, including 4 mailers, is planned to get the word out. March 1 is the target date for starting the new system.

Street Cans

Checco noted that his department worked with CBPA on an initiative to reduce the number of garbage cans on Ludlow Avenue. The idea was to decrease clutter and make the street look more attractive and welcoming. Some residents have complained about the loss of the cans. Brown said his experience with the Park Board and the Public Services Department is that more cans do not prevent littering. It’s better to have fewer cans regularly served (emptied) than a larger amount not serviced. San Francisco went through a similar analysis and drastically reduced the number of trashcans without increasing the litter problem. Checco is working with UC on a study to explore behaviors around depositing trash in cans.

Trustee Adam Balz asked if the street cans are going to be emptied more frequently. Checco said that will be part of the Friday blitz.

An audience member asked if the department has a litter patrol officer. Checco said there is one person. The audience member also asked why they the city did not sponsor a recycling day for hazardous materials such as batteries, light bulbs, etc. Checco said the city has a program implemented in cooperation with Keep Cincinnati Beautiful, but perhaps the city has not done a good job promoting these events.

CTM President Ben Pantoja made a motion to create the following resolution regarding the street cans on Ludlow Avenue:

Resolution Regarding Trash Can Removal on Ludlow Avenue

According to the minutes of the September 15th CBPA Meeting, someone at that meeting recommended formation of a “Trash Task Force” to help evaluate the current program to reduce trash cans on Ludlow. CTM strongly supports the creation of such a “Trash Task Force” and would be willing to

help recruit volunteers or a “Task Force Leader” to complete tasks such as the following:

- Creating and sharing with CBPA and CTM a written plan to collect and evaluate data related to the Trash Can removal.
- Collecting data on litter and on which trash cans, if any, are most likely to overflow before the City empties them. This data must be very specific and well documented.
- Collecting any other data the Task Force deems valuable such as surveys of businesses, landlords, or nearby home owners.
- Analyzing the data to identify top priority issues.
- Creating recommendations as needed to adjust the current trash can configuration

Pantoja will follow up with Gerald Checco from Cincinnati Public Services Department and with Scott Crawford from CBPA regarding this resolution. The resolution was passed with a vote of 7 trustees in favor, 5 against, and 2 abstained.

Issue 8 – Museum Center

Jane McKnight of Cincinnati Museum Center asked for support of Issue 8, a one-quarter of one-cent sales tax that will last for 5 years. Funds will be used solely for the renovation. The total budget for repair/renovation of the building is \$200 million. Other funds will come from some tax credits and philanthropy. The tax levy approved by voters in 2009 expires this year.

Planned Gaslight Properties Development on Whitfield Avenue

Dave Taylor, owner of Gaslight Property, reported that his company has plans for a Class A development of apartments on Whitfield at Lowell Avenue. Northpointe Group Real Estate is the developer and CR Architecture + Design is the project architect.

Rick Kimbler of Northpointe Group said it will be a significant new addition to the Clifton community. CR Architecture has been working on the plans for 10 months. Sari Lehtenin of CR Architecture reported that nine existing apartment buildings totaling 70 units will be torn down and the new development will be two buildings of about 118 high-end rental apartments. The development is designed for young professionals and “move downs” and is not a student housing project. Parking will be provided on surface and inside some of the buildings.

The architects are working toward LEED Silver certification and the emphasis is on a walkable, bikable community. The topography of the site is wooded and beautiful but challenging for construction. The design intent is to keep the buildings fairly low, 3 stories with undergrade parking. This is about the same height as the existing buildings. To be a “good neighbor,” the buildings will be stepped back from the street more than the existing units. An entrance will have a bike shelter. The

buildings were designed to respect the traditional character of Clifton, with materials in sync with the neighborhood. Buildings will have corner balconies with stacked porches.

The units will range from studios to two-bedrooms, from 650 sq. ft. to 1150 sq. ft.

Trustee Bruce Bernard asked about the height of the buildings in comparison to what is currently there. The current buildings are 3 stories high and the new buildings will be 3 stories with undergrade parking.

Trustee Adam Hyland asked about planned parking for the development. Kimbler said the current city zoning calls for 1.5 spaces per unit, but the new development will only have 1.2 spaces per unit. They will need a variance for the lower amount. Kimbler said they are trying to preserve as much greenspace as possible, and they believe not all residents will own cars.

Trustee Eric Urbas asked when the development will be finished. Kimbler said February or March 2016.

Park Board Plan for Deer Culling in Clifton Parks

Jim Godby, Park Board, reported during the August 2014 CTM meeting about planned deer culling in two Clifton parks. After a *Clifton Chronicle* article reported the plans to use volunteer bow hunters to control the deer population, some neighborhood residents expressed disagreement with the policy. Some circulated petitions, attended Park Board meetings, and communicated with CTM about their strong disagreement with the plan.

Godby presented his report again and noted that the Park Board practices deer population management for ecological reasons, for forest regeneration. Overbrowsing by deer is doing substantial damage to the ecosystems in Cincinnati parks. The Park Board began analyzing the deer herd in 1995 and monitored it through 2007 to determine population impacts. The Park Board explored several options for population control, including fencing (not practical), relocation of deer (not allowed by the state Division of Wildlife), birth control (not considered an option yet because its effectiveness is not proven and is also not legal in Ohio because the drug used for contraceptive purposes is not approved by the EPA).

Brett Beaty, Ohio Division of Wildlife, said use of contraceptives for wildlife has been evolving over the last several years. There have been some successes, mostly in limited populations. There is ongoing research, most recently in Hastings-on-the-Hudson, NY, which just started a contraceptive research program.

The Division of Wildlife's stance currently is that in order to provide contraception for any wild animal, you must be permitted by the Div. of Wildlife to do so. Currently there is no hard data to support contraception or even inoculation. As research

evolves and new information comes along, there may be a time when contraception is an option.

Wildlife contraception is currently regulated by the federal EPA, similar to a pesticide. Any substance used for contraception must be registered with the state and a license procured. In Ohio, there are no such drugs registered for contraceptive use. One of the contraceptive drugs currently being used is PZP. It's a protein taken from a swine and when injected, prohibits sperm and egg from making contact. PZP looks like it could be effective for about 2 years. It has to be physically injected into animal. Perhaps in the future, contraceptives could be administered via food or a bait, but this is not available so far.

Godby noted that the Park Board used police sharpshooters for the deer population culling for a couple of years prior to 2008, then could no longer afford it. The Park Board now has had five safe bow-hunting seasons to date. The cost per deer for bow hunters is \$60/deer, whereas sharpshooters cost \$290/deer.

The Park Board estimates there are 38 deer in the two Clifton Parks in question. 15-20 deer per square mile is typical, so the current population is more than twice the number ideal for a healthy deer habitat. This is resulting in deer overbrowsing important plant life in the two areas. Mt. Storm has important wildflower populations and will also be impacted by I-75 construction, so the Park Board is very concerned with restoration and deer population control there. Dave Gamstetter of the Park Board also noted that as ODOT is widening I-75 and will take 1.4 acres of the park as permanent right-of-way (and is clearing 5 acres), there will be considerable investment in restoring the hillside and planting vegetation again. Overpopulation of deer will threaten the health of the restored areas, as the new vegetation will be in browsing range of the deer.

Several audience members spoke against the deer culling. Robert Gutzwiller, who has lived on Rawson Woods Circle since 1992, opposes the program for many reasons. He reported that when several neighbors attended the most recent Park Board meeting, the bow hunting was delayed from the planned start date of September 27 until October 17 to give neighbors the chance to explore alternatives. Gutzwiller wants Clifton to know that we don't have to kill the deer; there are other solutions to the problem.

Katherine Gutzwiller, also of Rawson Woods Circle, reported a petition drive with 250 signatures. Her home overlooks Edgewood Grove. She said many neighbors, especially those with children, are shocked and hurt by the idea of killing deer, and she is concerned about children being traumatized by deer killing. She reminded the audience that the deer killing in Edgewood Grove would happen a block away from Fairview School.

Laurie Briggs, who lives next to Mt. Storm, reminded the audience that the Park Board is not the enemy. She said she was baffled by Mr. Beaty's statement that there

is no hard data on contraception. She said there is 25 years of hard data in field tests, including in large-scale suburban environments. Results of those studies have been remarkably good. She has been in recent email correspondence with the communications director of the NIST (Dept. of Commerce) who described their PZT contraceptive project as being a resounding success over the past 15 years. She has substantial information on PZT as a contraceptive option. It has shown to be effective in suburban environments, and safe and legal and cost-effective when you take into account grants available from animal rights organizations.

Chris Lottman, also a Clifton resident, said several neighbors have been researching alternatives. She has been looking into sterilization and is in contact with a group doing an ongoing community study. There is no silver bullet or arrow. We need to get together as a community, including working with bow hunters., to find a solution. She has been in contact with the Humane Society of the US, which has grants available to support these kinds of initiatives.

Millie Schafer, PhD., research scientist retired from the CDC and a Clifton neighbor, said she has been studying the deer situation for a number of years. She described the compensatory rebound effect, which is the reproductive response of a species by which a sudden increase in food resources, due to a sudden decrease in the population, induces a high reproductive rate. When applied to deer, it means that when large populations are killed, the remaining deer benefit from enhanced food supply and begin to produce more deer (twins) and begin to reproduce at a younger age (as early as 1 yr. old).

Sharon Buckner, a Clifton Heights resident, said she had never heard of the deer-hunting program and concluded that the Park Board had not done a good job of letting people know about it. She also noted she was disturbed to learn from Godby that bow hunters are allowed to gut and butcher the bodies on site and leave the entrails.

An unidentified audience member said he is also a taxpayer and is glad the Park Board saved taxpayers \$500,000 over the last several years using bow hunters instead of police sharpshooters.

Another audience member named Jeff MacElravy (sp) said he has lived in Clifton many years and is a bow hunter. Bow hunting is a sport and recreation and is also a good tool for managing the deer population. We have to allow the Park Board to manage its properties. Bow hunting is effective. The meat can be eaten. As far as leaving the entrails in the park, that is a food source for other animals. Bow hunting is the best and most economical way to control the deer numbers right now. If there is another way of doing it, it should be figured out and funded. But right now, this is the best way.

Nayana Shah said she will attend the next Park Board meeting with many questions about the statistics they are quoting. She watches the deer and babies come into her

back yard. She has seen how the mother loves the babies. They have relationships just like humans and we should not forget that. We should respect the nature around us. They are friendly and nice creatures and we have to remember that.

Another audience member identified himself as a deer hunter who lives on Lowell Avenue. As hunters, we do respect nature and respect the animals. The deer meant is eaten so it is not a waste. This is a win/win/win program. We're not just our here murdering animals. My family will eat deer all winter long.

Steve Slack said deer browse on Howell Avenue. He likes deer and understands the Park Board is not eliminating all deer. He said our parks are very stressed with invasive species. Deer are devastating plants in our parks. It's an unfortunate situation in our times. He said he supports the deer-culling program that will allow our parks to survive.

Additional people wanted to speak but it was 9 p.m. and CTM had other business to complete. The next park board meeting is October 16.

Treasurer's Report

CTM Trustee/Treasurer Michael Moran, CTM reported that for the month of September, CTM had \$4,400 in income, mostly income from the golf outing. \$7,500 went to CCAC from the golf outing proceeds. Expenses in September were XXXX, including printing costs, operating expenses for Clifton Plaza, facility rental for CCAC, and insurance. CTM's total assets are \$75,249.50.

He also provided a snapshot look at the CTM 2014 budget. We had expected to run a \$3,100 deficit but because of additional unplanned expenses the deficit will be closer to \$8,000. Financially we are still in pretty good shape and we can always produce additional revenue.

CTM President Ben Pantoja asked about the Clifton Plaza LLC line item. CBPA wants CTM to start paying \$75/month to pay the person who cleans and sweeps the plaza during warm weather months. Moran said we have spent more than planned on plaza maintenance due to a bench being dislodged. He expects CTM will have to allocate more money to the plaza than estimated this year and moving forward.

Public Q&A

Audience member Karen Imbus, a former CTM president, said she is concerned about Mayor John Cranley's plans to improve Burnet Woods. A couple of weeks ago, the mayor set forth his goals including renovation of Burnett Woods and said University of Cincinnati President Santo Ono was in charge of the project. Imbus expressed concern that plans for the park might be progressing without the input of CTM and the neighborhood, and suggested CTM reach out to Ono and Cranley about being part of the process.

Trustee Adam Balz noted that he volunteered to be part of the planning group and he has never heard from them again.

Trustee Joyce Rich said at the Neighborhoods of Uptown meeting last month, she learned the university has hired Niehoff Studios to do some groundwork, with questionnaires to students and businesses.

Adjournment/next meeting

The meeting was adjourned at about 9:10 p.m.

The next meeting is Monday, November 4, at CCAC.